

PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES

Date of Meeting: Thursday, September 18, 2008

Time of Meeting: 6:00 p.m.

Place of Meeting: Red Bluff Community/Senior
Center

1500 So. Jackson Street
Red Bluff, CA

Commissioners Present: Jean Moran

Bob Carrel

Andrew Christ

Doug Dale

Greg Latourell

Staff Present: Scot Timboe, Planning Director
Cheryl Smith, Deputy City Clerk
Mike Bachmeyer, Division Chief
Gerry Gray, Fire Chief
Richard Crabtree City Attorney

Chairperson Latourell called the meeting to order at 6:05 p.m.

Gerry gray, Fire Chief, led the pledge of allegiance and the assembly joined in.

CITIZEN COMMENTS

There were no citizen comments.

**PUBLIC HEARING TO RECEIVE COMMENTS ON
THE RE-CIRCULATED PORTIONS OF THE
ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT FOR THE
WAL-MART SUPERCENTER PROJECT – 608
LUTHER ROAD; APN 033-180-860; SCH NO.
2004012088**

Scot Timboe, Planning Director, reviewed the staff report and power point which incorporated information prepared by the consultants and gave staff's recommendation that the Planning Commission:

1. Hear the informational summary presentation by the Consultants.
2. Conduct the Public Hearing on the RPEIR and receive all public comments and provide any additional comments on the RPEIR to staff.

Chairperson Latourell opened the Public Hearing opened at 6:42 p.m.

Brenda Ballentine, concerned resident, stated that she lives directly across the street from Wal-Mart, can hear forklifts and refrigeration units and that she

doesn't agree with the db's, they are not realistic noise levels. She stated that there is a different tolerance of noise for everyone. She also raised concerns about noise with windows open.

Scot Timboe reported that the consultants are professional individuals who the City was already working with, and who are experts in their field.

Judy Cabra, Wal-Mart employee, stated that there are no forklifts that are used during unloading and that the unloading is done by a walking ramp (live floor).

Ed Ballentine, concerned resident, has lived in the area for 20 years, was for the first Wal-Mart, but is against it now. He doesn't know how a fence will help with the noise levels and stated that he does hear sweepers going throughout the night. He lives 25 feet from the road; the trucks will sit and idle to keep drivers warm. This move is right across from his residence and currently the trucks radio frequencies cut into his television set. His concern is the noise, not just from them, but from what is around him. Sweeper noise and trucks noise will reflect off this building. He doesn't want to be kept up all night, as he has a physical problem where he needs his rest.

Pat Houck Talbert, concerned citizen, stated that no one has addressed the truck fumes and the local traffic will be moved closer to the residences. Wal-Mart will not make that much more money, just creating problems for residents.

Lana Kitchell, concerned citizen, questioned who pays for the EIR and stated her concerns about the traffic, kids going to school, the elderly, noise level and also the rumor going around that if the supercenter is not built here it will be built in Corning. She expressed her concerns with the local businesses being affected.

Wilkie Talbert, concerned citizen, stated that he had no issues with the re-circulated portion of the EIR. His objections go back to the first hearing and the traffic, which has only gotten worse. The traffic on Luther Road has increased and the traffic will be a lot worse. Other points that will affect traffic are the Shasta College Center, which is currently being constructed. Damage to the existing businesses in Red Bluff has not been discussed and the downtown is still recovering from the first Wal-Mart opening. Opening a supercenter will damage a lot of the grocery businesses. The additional people that are hired will bring increase costs to health costs for the

county and the city. Operating profits are not retained in the community as local business does.

Tim Chaffin, resident, thanked staff for their hard work, there is a process, but for some reason the process is slanted in respect to government as industry, profits and gains. From the rebuttals to the original EIR, to items outlined by the judge makes people feel that it's too difficult for the government to uphold the position of the community. This has always been an improper location for the store and he doesn't understand why the board let this happen. He stated that he felt it should be built in a better location. He asked that the Planning Commission have the enthusiasm to understand what this community is a about.

Larry Stevens, resident, stated that this meeting was to review some of the changes that were court ordered but also will improve the project. Wal-Mart has scaled back its plans; He pointed out that Raleys had recently undergone a remodel and that new businesses have moved in and out. Since the original approval the housing market is down, people have had to relocate for jobs, some out of the area. He stated that things have to change and change is resisted, but what we need to take into consideration is the Southside Study, in which CalTrans has a

project planned for south of town, where Vista Way will open onto Montgomery Road and help with the traffic flow. There's a lot of fix's and a lot of changes, but we need to move forward. Wal-Mart has been here a number of years, have been a contributor to the community; has donated probably millions of dollars to organizations. With McMahan's closing, which is not part of Wal-Mart, things change and he asked that the Planning Commission keep in mind that they are doing their job and asking people for their opinions.

Richard Clapp, concerned citizen, stated that he still thinks it a shame to consider the Mill Street area. It's a good thing that the Planning Commission will hear this at future meeting; it's a shame that the sound issue is out of whack in his mind. At least a sound wall is in play, but they choose to put an incomplete sound wall where the most people live and that should be changed. The other issue is traffic, new housing has gone in, will go in and a restructure of the traffic count should be considered. Emergency services have become more critical, and are a problem now. With an increase in traffic it will become a problem for someone to get in and/or out. There were many different sites that could have been considered, such as over on Montgomery Road. Seven issues regarding sound were redone

in some fashion, but found to be the same and these tests seem to be inadequate to his mind. One final issue that should be dealt with is that Commissioner Dale has indicated in previous open hearings that he has some distant family that does not live in his home who own property to the west and he should recuse himself from voting, I guess that is ok though.

Ken Close, resident, stated that he lives in the area and if there is a noise problem then Raleys and Moss Lumber need to be addressed also, as well as boom boxes. He continued by pointing out that at one time there was a mill operating in the area three properties down in the industrial land, all day and all night.

Ursula Davis, resident, stated that she loves the downtown area and that Wal-Mart pays wages that require people to go onto community welfare. She would like to see jobs that help people help their family.

CK Jackson, concerned resident, stated that the existing subdivision in that area was built when Diamond National was operating 24 hours a day. He questioned how many people the city has lining up to open stores, such as clothing in Red Bluff.

Mr. Timboe stated that at this point there are no requests from Target, or other womens/mens clothing stores.

Jackson Williams, concerned citizen, stated that he was born and raised here, has seen stores come and go and the City has lost all it's shopping to Redding and Chico. He stated that we still have some people that don't want anything come into Red Bluff, but our town has lost industry etc and people blame it on Wal-Mart, when Wal-Mart doesn't have anything to do with it. The noise level is not that bad, the streets are 50 feet wide, at least. These people live right by a train and they don't complain about it. He's for Wal-Mart building; there are no other large lots that will accommodate this store. Wal-Mart wants this new store so that they can put groceries in and so that they can own their own building (currently leasing and the lease will not allow groceries to be built.)

Brain Brennan, concerned resident, stated that he would like to sit down with one or all to discuss this process.

Mr. Timboe stated that he would be happy to sit down and discuss, just contact him.

Ed Ballentine stated that he was concerned with graffiti and questioned how graffiti on the wall would be taken care of.

Lana Kitchen stated that she believes that Wal-Mart hurts communities and sets the standards for low wages. Wal-Mart employees can't afford their products, it's unethical. Wal-mart destroys the environment, increases traffic and pays their employees less.

Pat Houck Talbert stated that as part of the EIR, is there any kind of requirement regarding air quality.

Rick Crabtree, City Attorney, stated that there was an entire chapter regarding air quality but that was nothing that the court found fault with.

There being no other comments Chairperson Latourell closed the Public Hearing at 7:33 p.m.

Chairperson Latourell thanked everyone for their comments.

Commission Bob Carrel stated that he appreciated the turnout, because it is addressing just the issues in the lawsuit. He stated that he feels that this has been a democratic process, he is also a local citizen

and had issues with the original presentation. It was voted on by the Planning Commission and City Council and the lawsuit brought it back to the Planning Commission for reconsideration. He continued by saying that the Planning Commission would look at all the issues and that the Commission does take it seriously.

Commissioner Jean Moran thanked everyone for attending. She stated that she also was born and raised in Red Bluff and that the best interest of the community is what she will be looking at.

Chairperson Latourell stated that this was an information gathering hearing and he will ask questions at the next meeting once he has had time to review his notes.

There being no further business Chairperson Latourell adjourned the meeting at 7:40 p.m. until September 23, 2008, for another project.

Respectfully submitted,

s/Scot Timboe
Planning Director

